

2004

The State of Utah v. Brooks Bradshaw : Brief of Respondent

Utah Court of Appeals

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.law.byu.edu/byu_ca2



Part of the [Law Commons](#)

Original Brief Submitted to the Utah Court of Appeals; digitized by the Howard W. Hunter Law Library, J. Reuben Clark Law School, Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah; machine-generated OCR, may contain errors.

Christine F. Soltis; Assistant Attorney General; Mark L. Shurtleff; Utah Attorney General; Attorneys for Petitioner.

Joan C. Watt; Robert K. Heineman; Salt Lake Legal Defender Assoc.; Attorneys for Respondent.

Recommended Citation

Brief of Respondent, *Utah v. Brooks Bradshaw*, No. 20040975 (Utah Court of Appeals, 2004).
https://digitalcommons.law.byu.edu/byu_ca2/5363

This Brief of Respondent is brought to you for free and open access by BYU Law Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Utah Court of Appeals Briefs by an authorized administrator of BYU Law Digital Commons. Policies regarding these Utah briefs are available at http://digitalcommons.law.byu.edu/utah_court_briefs/policies.html. Please contact the Repository Manager at hunterlawlibrary@byu.edu with questions or feedback.

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF UTAH

THE STATE OF UTAH, :

Appellee/Petitioner, :

v. :

BROOKS BRADSHAW, : Case No. 20040975-SC

Appellant/Respondent. : Petitioner is not incarcerated.

**BRIEF OF RESPONDENT
ON CERTIORARI REVIEW**

JOAN C. WATT (3967)
ROBERT K. HEINEMAN (5481)
SALT LAKE LEGAL DEFENDER ASSOC.
424 East 500 South, Suite 300
Salt Lake City, Utah 84111

Attorneys for Appellant/Respondent

CHRISTINE F. SOLTIS (3039)
ASSISTANT ATTORNEY GENERAL
MARK L. SHURTLEFF (4666)
UTAH ATTORNEY GENERAL
Heber M. Wells Building
160 East 300 South, 6th Floor
P. O. Box 140854
Salt Lake City, Utah 84114-0854

Attorneys for Plaintiff/Petitioner

FILED
UTAH APPELLATE COURTS
AUG 15 2005

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF UTAH

THE STATE OF UTAH, :

Appellee/Petitioner, :

v. :

BROOKS BRADSHAW, : Case No. 20040975-SC

Appellant/Respondent. : Petitioner is not incarcerated.

**BRIEF OF RESPONDENT
ON CERTIORARI REVIEW**

JOAN C. WATT (3967)
ROBERT K. HEINEMAN (5481)
SALT LAKE LEGAL DEFENDER ASSOC.
424 East 500 South, Suite 300
Salt Lake City, Utah 84111

Attorneys for Appellant/Respondent

CHRISTINE F. SOLTIS (3039)
ASSISTANT ATTORNEY GENERAL
MARK L. SHURTLEFF (4666)
UTAH ATTORNEY GENERAL
Heber M. Wells Building
160 East 300 South, 6th Floor
P. O. Box 140854
Salt Lake City, Utah 84114-0854

Attorneys for Plaintiff/Petitioner

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	iii
JURISDICTIONAL STATEMENT	1
OPINION BELOW	1
QUESTION PRESENTED ON CERTIORARI AND STANDARD OF REVIEW	1
RELEVANT STATUTORY AND CONSTITUTIONAL PROVISIONS	2
STATEMENT OF THE CASE	2
STATEMENT OF FACTS	3
SUMMARY OF THE ARGUMENT	8
ARGUMENT	
POINT. THE COURT OF APPEALS CORRECTLY CONCLUDED THAT THE AMOUNT RESPONDENT RECEIVED FROM EACH OF THE COMMUNICATIONS FRAUD COUNTS COULD NOT BE AGGREGATED SO AS TO ELEVATE EACH COUNT TO A SECOND DEGREE FELONY.	10
A. The Communications Fraud Statute Is Ambiguous.	12
B. The Majority Correctly Concluded that Legislative History and Policy Considerations Support Its Conclusion that the Counts Involved Separate Schemes and Could Not Be Aggregated.	16
C. The Majority Correctly Characterized the Word "Scheme."	22

D. The Majority’s Holding that the Amounts Taken in the Eleven Acts Could Not Be Aggregated so as to Charge Bradshaw with Eleven Second Degree Felonies Is Consistent with the Constitutional Protection Against Double Jeopardy, Due Process and the Single Larceny Rule.	26
E. The Court of Appeals’ Holding that the State Could Not Attribute the Aggregated Amount to Each Victim Should Be Upheld.	34
CONCLUSION	35
Addendum A: <u>State v. Bradshaw</u> , 2004 UT App 298, 99 P.3d 359	
Addendum B: Order granting state’s petition for writ of certiorari	
Addendum C: Texts of relevant statutory and constitutional provisions	
Addendum D: Stipulated Testimony for Preliminary Hearing	
Addendum E: Judgment	
Addendum F: Legislative history	

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page

CASES

<u>In re A.T.</u> , 2001 UT 82, 34 P.3d 228	2
<u>H.J. Inc. v. Northwestern Bell Tel. Co.</u> , 492 U.S. 299, 109 S.Ct. 2893, 106 L.Ed.2d 195 (1989)	14, 21, 35
<u>Intermountain Slurry Seal v. Labor Comm'n</u> , 2002 UT App 164, 48 P.3d 252	27
<u>Kolender v. Lawson</u> , 461 U.S. 352, 103 S.Ct. 1855, 75 L.Ed.2d 903 (1983)	28, 29
<u>Miller v. State</u> , 866 P.2d 130 (Alaska Ct. App. 1994)	24
<u>North Carolina v. Pearce</u> , 395 U.S. 711 (1969)	27
<u>People v. Howes</u> , 222 P.2d 969 (Cal. Ct. App. 1950)	31
<u>State Farm Mut. Auto. Ins. Co. v. Clyde</u> , 920 P.2d 1183 (Utah 1996)	20
<u>State v. Barker</u> , 624 P.2d 694 (Utah 1981)	30, 31
<u>State v. Bradshaw</u> , 2004 UT App 298, 99 P.3d 359	1, 2, 3, 10, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 25, 33, 35
<u>State v. Featherson</u> , 781 P.2d 424 (Utah 1989)	23
<u>State v. Green</u> , 2004 UT 76, 99 P.3d 820	28, 29
<u>State v. Hansen</u> , 608 P.2d 1083 (Mont. 1980)	23
<u>State v. Herrera</u> , 1999 UT 64, 993 P.2d 854	30

	<u>Page</u>
<u>State v. Hutchings</u> , 950 P.2d 425 (Utah Ct. App. 1997)	13, 16
<u>State v. Ives</u> , 927 P.2d 762 (Ariz. 1996)	24
<u>State v. Kerekes</u> , 622 P.2d 1161 (Utah 1980)	23
<u>State v. Kimbel</u> , 620 P.2d 515 (Utah 1980)	30-31
<u>State v. Kimbrough</u> , 69 F.3d 723 (5th Cir. 1995)	27
<u>State v. Morrison</u> , 2001 UT 73, 31 P.3d 547	27, 28
<u>State v. Ostler</u> , 2001 UT 68, 31 P.3d 528	16
<u>State v. Patience</u> , 944 P.2d 381 (Utah Ct. App. 1997)	17, 30, 31, 34
<u>State v. Ross</u> , 951 P.2d 236 (Utah Ct. App. 1997)	29-30, 32, 33
<u>State v. Tapp</u> , 490 P.2d 334 (Utah 1971)	17
<u>United States v. Dothard</u> , 666 F.2d 498 (11th Cir. 1982)	24
<u>United States v. Krezdorn</u> , 639 F.2d 1327 (5th Cir. 1981)	24, 26
<u>Vill. of Hoffman Estates v. The Flipside, Hoffman Estates, Inc.</u> , 455 U.S. 489, 102 S.Ct. 1186, 71 L.Ed.2d 362 (1982)	29
<u>In re Worthen</u> , 926 P.2d 853 (Utah 1996)	13, 16

STATUTES, RULES AND CONSTITUTIONAL PROVISIONS

18 U.S.C. §§ 1341-47 (1985)	17
Utah Code Ann. § 68-3-12 (2000)	15, 19, 20
Utah Code Ann. § 76-1-104 (2003)	20

	<u>Page</u>
Utah Code Ann. § 76-1-106 (2003)	20
Utah Code Ann. § 76-3-203 (1999)	20
Utah Code Ann. § 76-6-501 (2003)	34
Utah Code Ann. § 76-10-1603	35
Utah Code Ann. § 76-10-1801 (2003)	1, 2, 11, 12, 13, 15, 31, 34
Utah Code Ann. § 78-2-2 (2002)	1
Utah R. Evid. 404	23, 24
U.S. Const. amend. V	2
U.S. Const. amend. VIII	30

OTHER AUTHORITIES

Floor Debate, 46 th Leg., Gen. Sess. (February 11, 1985) (House Recording No. 4)	16
Floor Debate, 46 th Leg., Gen. Sess. (February 27, 1985) (Senate Recording No. 129)	17
Graham, Handbook of Federal Evidence § 404.5	25
McCormick, Evidence Sec. 190 (2 nd ed. 1972)	25
2A Norman J. Singer, Statutes and Statutory Construction § 45:02 (6th ed. 2000)	14, 20